

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
DISTRICT OF NEW JERSEY  
Civil Action No. 09-197

2009 FEB 23 A 10:30

-----  
In Regard to the Matter of:

UNITED STATES  
DISTRICT COURT

Bayside State Prison  
Litigation

OPINION/REPORT  
OF THE  
SPECIAL MASTER

THOMAS COLLIER

-vs-

WILLIAM H. FAUVER, et al,

Defendants.  
-----

\* \* \* \*

FRIDAY, JANUARY 23, 2009

\* \* \* \*

BEFORE THE HONORABLE JOHN W. BISSELL, SPECIAL MASTER

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Transcript of proceedings in the above  
matter taken by Theresa O. Mastroianni, Certified  
Court Reporter, license number 30X100085700, and  
Notary Public of the State of New Jersey at the  
United States District Court House, One Gerry Plaza,  
Camden, New Jersey, 08102, commencing at 12:30 PM.

MASTROIANNI & FORMAROLI, INC.  
Certified Court Reporting & Videoconferencing  
251 South White Horse Pike  
Audubon, New Jersey 08106  
856-546-1100

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

A P P E A R A N C E S:

ROSELLI & GRIEGEL, PC  
BY: MARK ROSELLI, ESQUIRE  
- and -  
BY: JAMES LAZZARO ESQUIRE  
1337 STATE HIGHWAY 33  
HAMILTON SQUARE, NEW JERSEY 08690  
609-586-2257  
ATTORNEYS FOR THE DEFENDANTS

1 JUDGE BISSELL: I am now reopening  
2 proceedings in the matter of Thomas Collier, docket  
3 number 09-197.

4 This opinion/report is being issued  
5 pursuant to the directives of the Order of Reference  
6 to a Special Master and the Special Master's  
7 Agreement and the guiding principles of law which  
8 underlie this decision to be applied to the facts  
9 upon which it is based as set forth in the jury  
10 instructions in the Walker and Mejias jury charges to  
11 the extent applicable to the allegations of Mr.  
12 Collier.

13 As finalized after review under Local  
14 Civil Rule 52.1, this transcript will constitute the  
15 written report required under paragraph seven of the  
16 Order of Reference to a Special Master.

17 Mr. Collier was housed in F Unit and he  
18 witnessed Officer Baker's death. In fact, he  
19 witnessed him being stabbed at the podium. He  
20 testified, however, and I find that this testimony is  
21 accurate, that he was afraid to acknowledge to  
22 Internal Affairs when examined on that very same day  
23 that he had witnessed this and did not respond  
24 positively in that respect.

25 The inmates in F Unit as a whole were

1 out of F Unit for a long time on the 30th of July.  
2 Pretty close to 12 hours. And this is not surprising  
3 because they were taken, first, to Internal Affairs  
4 for interrogation and then later to the gym to await  
5 their return.

6 While it's not expressly set forth in  
7 this record, my best recollection is that the  
8 facility was also searched at that time. There is no  
9 reason it wouldn't have been.

10 P-163 reflects that the SOGs went into  
11 the unit to extract the inmates at approximately 1:10  
12 PM and began those extractions at that time. Mr.  
13 Collier, like other inmates, went to Internal Affairs  
14 and then to the gym. It appears that he was not one  
15 of the first persons taken to the gym because upon  
16 examination of videotape, which I'll discuss a little  
17 more completely in a few minutes, his testimony was  
18 that he was not seated toward the front of the gym,  
19 but that it was at least half full by the time he  
20 arrived.

21 Mr. Collier said repeatedly and  
22 insisted on both direct and cross-examination that  
23 the position which he was directed to assume in the  
24 gymnasium was with his upper torso bent from the  
25 waist out from his body at a right angle or even more

1 than that with his head down and his hands clasped  
2 behind his back, the back of his head.

3           However, the film exhibits of F Unit,  
4 and there were three of them shown in succession from  
5 a time period of shortly after two o'clock PM until  
6 after 6:30 PM, showed that none of the persons seated  
7 in the gym on that day brought in from F Unit, and by  
8 the latter of those tapes this would have included  
9 Mr. Collier, were required to sit in any such  
10 position. They were expected to remain still and  
11 they did so for the most part, but they were seated  
12 essentially as we've come to call it Indian style on  
13 the floor, legs crossed, hands down at the sides and  
14 resting on the gym floor.

15           At 8:35 according to Exhibit D-544A the  
16 infirmary was summoned to the gym because Mr. Collier  
17 had chest pains and trouble breathing. I find that  
18 this was brought on not by him having been subjected  
19 for several hours to this seating position which he  
20 described, but rather from increasing anxiety and  
21 exhaustion. I find that his testimony is credible  
22 that he may well have had to have been dragged or  
23 assisted in moving to the back of the gym from his  
24 seat on the floor to await the arrival of the nurse,  
25 but I do not find it is credible that he was slammed

1 up against the grate and sustained cuts to the back  
2 of his head as he testified here. That type of  
3 conduct is totally inconsistent with that observable  
4 on the three films that were shown with regard to the  
5 manner in which one or more inmates was indeed  
6 removed from the line on the floor for one reason or  
7 another.

8 Now, I realize that the event that  
9 occurred with Mr. Collier's discomfort occurred at  
10 about 8:30 PM, approximately two hours after the  
11 conclusion of the last of the videotapes that we  
12 watched, but I find no basis to conclude that somehow  
13 or other after those tapes were no longer being  
14 taken, that the SOG officers on the very first day of  
15 this operation with a high level of administrative  
16 and civilian scrutiny would suddenly change their MO  
17 dramatically, force the inmates into much more  
18 uncomfortable seating positions, drag them across the  
19 floor and bounce them off the grate. Furthermore, if  
20 indeed he had been cut on the head and treated, I  
21 find no reason why there would not be a nurse's note  
22 about it. Once again, we are at the very outset of  
23 these proceedings, he was treated in the gym area  
24 initially and I find no evidence, although he asserts  
25 it, that there was any sort of master coverup of

1 injuries of this sort which included the nurses  
2 either as willing or unwilling participants.

3 In Mr. Collier's case he was well cared  
4 for in the infirmary, his arrival there was  
5 documented, he was kept there overnight as a  
6 precaution in light of his difficulties in breathing  
7 and chest discomfort and returned to F Unit on the  
8 next day.

9 He testifies as to another event on or  
10 about the fifth of August, it's determined from  
11 P-164, a log indicating that SOG entered F Unit on  
12 that day as well. They were extracting him from his  
13 cell and undertaking a strip search and at that point  
14 ordered him to undertake the very customary activity  
15 of spreading his legs, squatting and otherwise making  
16 himself susceptible to a rectal body cavity search.  
17 He resisted that order, from his own testimony, and  
18 questioned why it was that he particularly would have  
19 to be so searched because he wasn't concealing any  
20 weapon there. However, the officers insisted, as  
21 they had every right to do, to complete their  
22 procedure which included a rectal area search and one  
23 of them using his baton prodded him in that area,  
24 without penetration, to enforce the demand that Mr.  
25 Collier place himself in such a position that that



1     rectal search could be conducted. I find that at  
2     most there was used a modest force necessary to  
3     achieve this valid penal purpose.

4             Mr. Collier testified to other  
5     incidents of harassment to which he was subjected  
6     after the incidents mentioned above. However, they  
7     do not rise to the level of the infliction of  
8     punishment as encompassed in these proceedings.  
9     Among other things, there was no discernible physical  
10    impact or even potential injury that resulted.

11            Mr. Collier is a man with mental  
12    difficulties that, among other things, required  
13    ongoing medication to curb schizophrenia. This was  
14    indeed a long-standing condition which he brought with  
15    him to Bayside. Frankly, it does not take a great  
16    leap of faith or any expertise, I think, for me to  
17    conclude that his anxiety from witnessing Officer  
18    Baker's murder, his anxiety of being questioned about  
19    it and, in fact, lying to Internal Affairs that he  
20    hadn't observed it, and his lengthy sitting on the  
21    gym floor, in a situation obviously of considerable  
22    uncertainty and stress for him, are what led to his  
23    chest and breathing problems, as I mentioned before.

24            As to the other incident, his  
25    incredulity that he would be suspected of harboring a

1     weapon in a body cavity led him to question and  
2     resist this very legitimate routine search request.  
3     And indeed, of course, he was further embarrassed at  
4     being prodded in the rectum, accompanied by some very  
5     crude comments, once again for the purpose of getting  
6     him to comply.

7                     Mr. Collier evokes from me as well as  
8     from anybody else a measure of concern for the very  
9     difficult mental condition that he carries with him.  
10    But the events in question here neither rise to the  
11    level of the use of excessive force or, indeed, the  
12    infliction of punishment at all.

13                    Finally, although not every item of  
14    evidence has been discussed this this opinion/report,  
15    all evidence presented to the Special Master was  
16    reviewed and considered.

17                    For the reasons set forth above, I  
18    recommend in this report that the district court  
19    enter an order and judgment of no cause for action  
20    with regard to Thomas Collier.

21

22

23

24

25

## C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Theresa O. Mastroianni, a Notary Public and Certified Shorthand Reporter of the State of New Jersey, do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and accurate transcript of the testimony as taken stenographically by and before me at the time, place, and on the date hereinbefore set forth.

I DO FURTHER CERTIFY that I am neither a relative nor employee nor attorney nor counsel of any of the parties to this action, and that I am neither a relative nor employee of such attorney or counsel, and that I am not financially interested in the action.

*Theresa O. Mastroianni*

Theresa O. Mastroianni, C.S.R.  
Notary Public, State of New Jersey  
My Commission Expires May 5, 2010  
Certificate No. XI0857  
Date: February 10, 2009